

WELLESLEY HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
MAY 28, 2013; 6:45 PM
PLANNING BOARD OFFICE, TOWN HALL

Members Present: Jean Berry, Edwina McCarthy, David Giangrosso, David Smith, Lisa Abeles
Staff: Ethan Parsons, Erin Heacock
Also Present: Esperanza Dalzell, Scott Dalzell, Nancy Lanzarone, Dennis Fitzgerald

Chair Berry opened the public hearing at 6:45 pm.

8 Cottage Street

Documents:

- Letter of Intent, dated April 22, 2013
- Project Plans
 - Existing First Floor Plan, Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
 - Proposed First Floor Plan, Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
 - Existing Driveway Side Elevation, Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
 - Proposed Driveway Side Elevation, Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
 - Existing and Proposed Rear Elevation, Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
 - Existing and Proposed Side Elevation, Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
 - Proposed Garage Doors, Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
- Site Photographs
 - View of House from Cottage Street (Driveway Side), Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
 - View of House from Cottage Street (Front Door Side), Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
 - Side View of House from Driveway, Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
 - View of House from Back Yard, Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
 - View of Side from Back Yard, Prepared by Tiryaki Architectural Design, dated April 22, 2013
- Garage Door Cut Sheets

Discussion:

Vice Chair McCarthy chaired the board for the discussion of 8 Cottage Street. Homeowners, Scott and Esperanza Dalzell, presented the proposed renovations to the residence at 8 Cottage Street.

Ms. McCarthy stated that it appears that the front of the existing residence will remain the same. The proposed renovations include a small addition, replacing the garage doors, and adding new windows and a French door.

Mr. Dalzell stated that the garage is in disrepair.

WELLESLEY HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
MAY 28, 2013; 6:45 PM
PLANNING BOARD OFFICE, TOWN HALL

Ms. McCarthy asked about the rear of the residence. Ms. Dalzell stated that the existing arch window will remain, but the windows below it will be replaced with a French door.

Ms. McCarthy asked about the new garage door material. Ms. Dazell stated that a steel door is preferred.

Ms. McCarthy asked whether the new windows will match the existing windows. Ms. Dalzell stated that they would.

Ms. McCarthy asked about the deck. Ms. Dalzell stated that the existing deck will be removed. Mr. Dalzell stated that the deck is rotting and needs to be replaced. Mr. Smith stated that it looks like a portion of the deck will be retained off of the family room.

Ms. Abeles stated that she is pleased to see these renovations. She inquired about the mud room addition. Ms. Dalzell stated that the addition is no longer part of the project. Working with their architect, interior renovations will be completed so the addition is not needed.

Ms. Abeles also stated that the new windows are good upgrades.

Ms. Berry stated she has concerns about using steel for the new garage doors. Ms. McCarthy agreed with Ms. Berry's concern.

Ms. Abeles stated that steel can have a disappointing appearance. She stated other materials such as fiberglass or a plastic composite such as Azek.

Mr. Smith agreed that the plastic composite is a good choice as it won't rot like wood.

Ms. Berry stated wood would be the most appropriate material for the residence.

Ms. Abeles agreed that wood would have the best appearance, but you would not know the difference between wood and a plastic composite material.

Ms. Berry stated that a sample would be required.

Ms. Berry asked how visible the garage is from Cottage Street. She located a photograph in the application materials. It is very visible from Cottage Street.

Ms. Abeles reviewed the cut sheet provided on the preferred garage door. She stated the curved windows are not appropriate. Simple glass windows are appropriate.

Ms. McCarthy asked about the French door and window brand. Ms. Dalzell stated that the door and windows would be Andersen A Series.

Ms. McCarthy asked if the windows and door would be wood. Ms. Dalzell stated they are wood products.

Ms. Abeles stated she would like more details on the casing, specifically is it a wide wood casing. Ms. Abeles stated that many Andersen products have a narrow wood casing. She also stated that her preference is simulated divided lights not a snap-in grill.

WELLESLEY HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
MAY 28, 2013; 6:45 PM
PLANNING BOARD OFFICE, TOWN HALL

Ms. Abeles suggested that the applicants return to the HDC with a sample and specifications on the garage door as well as a specification sheet for the windows.

Ms. Dalzell asked if that was necessary since the rear of the residence is not visible from Cottage Street. Ms. McCarthy stated the rear of the residence is visible from Denton Road, so it is necessary.

Mr. Dalzell stated that they are flexible in their material choice. Ms. Abeles stated the applicants should consult with their architect and/or builder to use a window which has a true divided light rather than a snap-in grill.

Ms. Berry asked if the applicants are coming back to the HDC a specification on the Marvin window mentioned in the letter of intent would be appropriate too.

Ms. McCarthy asked if the arched window on the rear of the home is to remain, why not choose a French door which extends to the length of the arched window or vice versa. Ms. Abeles stated that she did not think it was necessary. Mr. Smith agreed that it wasn't necessary.

Ms. Berry stated that the applicants need to come back. Ms. Abeles asked the Planning Department Staff if the approval could be conditioned instead as she is aware that the Building Department has been slow to issue Building Permits. Mr. Parsons stated that a conditional approval is acceptable. The applicants would return to the Planning Department Staff with product specifications that satisfy the conditions. Mr. Smith agreed with a conditional approval.

Ms. Berry moved to approve the project subject to the following conditions:

1. The proposed windows should not use snap-in grills.
2. The proposed windows should have true divided lights.
3. The proposed French door and windows should have wood casings that match the wood casings of the existing windows.
4. The garage doors should be either wood or a plastic composite material.
5. A Building Permit cannot be issued until specifications for the windows, French doors, and garage doors are received and approved by the Planning Department.

Ms. Abeles seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously (5-0).

20 Cottage Street

Documents:

- Location of Venting Options, Prepared by Abeles & Associates Architects
- Sheet A-5, Floor Plans: New, Prepared by Abeles & Associates Architects, dated May 21, 2013
- Sheet A-7, Exterior Elevations: New, Prepared by Abeles & Associates Architects, dated May 21, 2013
- Vent Specification Sheet

Discussion:

The discussion of 20 Cottage is a continued discussion from the public hearing held on May 7, 2013. The continued discussion is focused on the removal and replacement of the chimney.

WELLESLEY HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
MAY 28, 2013; 6:45 PM
PLANNING BOARD OFFICE, TOWN HALL

Lisa Abeles, a Historic District Commissioner, recused herself from the Commission to present the proposed project as architect on behalf of the homeowners of 20 Cottage Street, Nancy Lanzarone and Dennis Fitzgerald.

Ms. Berry reminded the Commission that the existing stone chimney exited the roof on the left side of the residence. The originally proposed metal chimney exited the roof on the same side.

Ms. Abeles presented the current proposal for the removal and replacement of the chimney. Ms. Abeles stated that she, the homeowners, and the HVAC contractor spent the past few weeks researching options for the new metal chimney. They discovered that the suggestion of the Commission at the last meeting to route the flue through a soffit allowing it to exit out of a different location on the roof and to shorten the 8-foot height is not feasible due to restrictions on bending the flue. Ms. Abeles indicated that to convert the house to natural gas would cost a difference of approximately \$20,000 considering the road moratorium and the new equipment. Moving and bending the flue for an oil burning furnace as initially proposed would cost approximately \$10,000. After considering other options and the difference of \$10,000, the homeowners have decided to convert the home to natural gas in order to take advantage of more flexible options for venting the furnace and more flexible interior layout options.

Ms. Abeles described two options for venting: one is similar to a dryer vent on the side of the home or a small pipe similar to a plumbing stack out of the roof. There are restrictions on how close the air intake can be to the vent, so the roof vent would only be required if the intake and vent are too close.

In summary, Ms. Abeles stated the existing chimney will be removed and the applicants will convert their home from oil to natural gas in order to not have a metal chimney. The vent for the natural gas exhaust will likely be a vent similar to a dryer vent on the side of the house; however, if it is located too close to the air intake, the natural gas exhaust will vent through the roof in a pipe similar to a plumbing stack.

Ms. Berry asked about the transom window in the stairway. Ms. Abeles stated that she decided to do a 5 light window as recommended by the Commission.

Ms. Berry asked how big the roof vent would be if it's necessary. Ms. Abeles stated that it would not be very big. There is no heat coming out of vent, only condensation.

Ms. Berry asked if the roof vent would be painted black. Ms. Abeles stated it would.

Ms. Berry asked about the existing plumbing stack. Ms. Abeles stated it would remain as is.

Ms. Abeles stated the ideal situation would be side vent. There are specific codes which regulate its position including how high off the ground, how far from windows, etc.

Ms. McCarthy moved to approve the project, including the removal of the existing chimney and replacement of Window B consistent with the plans submitted dated May 21, 2013, and if the natural gas air intake and vent cannot be located on the side, the vent will be located on the roof. Ms. Berry seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously (4-0).

WELLESLEY HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
MAY 28, 2013; 6:45 PM
PLANNING BOARD OFFICE, TOWN HALL

Previous Minutes

Ms. Berry moved to accept the minutes from February 28, 2012, August 14, 2012, and May 7, 2013 (as amended by Ms. Abeles). Ms. McCarthy seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously (5-0).

Reorganization

Ms. McCarthy recognized Ms. Berry's service as Chair of the Historical District Commission. Ms. Berry will be resigning from the Commission on June 30, 2013.

The Commissioners discussed options for reorganization, and decided to wait to make a decision until the next meeting.

The Commission adjourned at approximately 7:40 pm.

Erin L. Heacock
Planner

Minutes Approved: July 9, 2013